APPENDIX I – COMPARISON OF ALTERNATIVES BY OBJECTIVE

Table I1. Comparison of Alternatives by Objective

Comparison of Alternatives by Objective	Alt A	Alt B	Alt C	Alt D
Physical Resources Program				
OBJ1. Achieve load reduction targets for upland forest and SEZs identified in the Lake Tahoe TMDL during the life of the plan.	X	X	X	X
OBJ2. Implement effective BMPs to achieve 95% implementation and effectiveness ratings forest-wide in BMP assessments annually, as determined by the Pacific Southwest Region's *Best Management Practices Effectiveness Program*.	X	X	X	X
OBJ3. Maintain up to date inventory of water rights and uses on NFS lands, and meet state requirements for maintaining water rights.	X	X	X	X
OBJ4. Implement actions to restore geomorphic and habitat function to approximately 5 miles of stream, and 350 acres of floodplain/SEZ by approximately 2016.	X	X	X	X
Forest Vegetation, Fuels and Fire Management Program				
OBJ5. Reduce surface, ladder and canopy fuels through thinning and fuel reduction treatments on 2,000 acres per year in the WUI.	X	X	X	X
OBJ6. Prescribed burning of surface fuels in the WUI occur on 1,800 acres per year when possible.	X	X		
Prescribed burning of surface fuels in the WUI occur on 2,100 acres per year when possible.			X	X

Comparison of Alternatives by Objective	Alt A	Alt B	Alt C	Alt D
White fir – mixed conifer				
OBJ7. From the mid-seral stages create approximately 50 acres of openings to early-seral white fir – mixed conifer type each year over the latter 10 years of plan implementation.	**X**	**X**		**X**
From the mid-seral stages create approximately 100 acres of openings to early-seral white fir – mixed conifer type each year over the latter 10 years of plan implementation.			**X**	
OBJ8. In stands historically dominated by pines, convert white fir-mixed conifer type generally in the early or mid-seral stages to Jeffrey pine by approximately 50 acres per year over the latter 10 years of plan implementation. Retain pines during conversion treatments.	**X**	**X**		**X**
In stands historically dominated by pines, convert white fir-mixed conifer type generally in the early or mid-seral stages to Jeffrey pine by approximately 100 acres per year over the latter 10 years of plan implementation. Retain pines during conversion treatments.			**X**	
OBJ9. Thin approximately 200 acres of white fir-mixed conifer each year over the latter 10 years of plan implementation to improve resiliency and reduce susceptibility to insects, disease, and drought.	**X**	**X**		
Thin approximately 400 acres of white fir-mixed conifer each year over the latter 10 years of plan implementation to improve resiliency and reduce susceptibility to insects, disease, and drought.			**X**	
Thin approximately 120 acres of white fir-mixed conifer each year over the latter 10 years of plan implementation to improve resiliency and reduce susceptibility to insects, disease, and drought.				**X**
Jeffrey pine				

Comparison of Alternatives by Objective	Alt A	Alt B	Alt C	Alt D
OBJ10. From the mid-seral stages create approximately 40 acres of openings to early-seral Jeffrey pine each year over the latter 10 years of plan implementation, and maintain it as the dominant species. Employ techniques to release early seral pine from competing vegetation if necessary. Post-disturbance event treatments will be used as opportunities to regenerate early seral Jeffrey pine. This objective may be accomplished in coordination with white fir – mixed conifer conversion objective, above.	X	X		X
From the mid-seral stages create approximately 80 acres of openings to early-seral Jeffrey pine each year over the latter 10 years of plan implementation, and maintain it as the dominant species. Employ techniques to release early seral pine from competing vegetation if necessary. Post-disturbance event treatments will be used as opportunities to regenerate early seral Jeffrey pine. This objective may be accomplished in coordination with white fir – mixed conifer conversion objective, above.			X	
OBJ11. Thin approximately 250 acres of Jeffrey pine each year over the latter 10 years of plan implementation to improve resiliency and reduce susceptibility to insects, disease, and drought.	X	X		
Thin approximately 500 acres of Jeffrey pine each year over the latter 10 years of plan implementation to improve resiliency and reduce susceptibility to insects, disease, and drought.			X	
Thin approximately 150 acres of Jeffrey pine each year over the latter 10 years of plan implementation to improve resiliency and reduce susceptibility to insects, disease, and drought.				X
Red fir				
OBJ12. From the mid-seral stages create approximately 10 acres of openings to early-seral red fir type each year over the latter 10 years of plan implementation. Utilize opportunities for treatment after disturbance events.	X	X		X

Comparison of Alternatives by Objective	Alt A	Alt B	Alt C	Alt D
From the mid-seral stages create approximately 20 acres of openings to early-seral red fir type each year over the latter 10 years of plan implementation. Utilize opportunities for treatment after disturbance events.			X	
OBJ13. Thin approximately 50 acres of red fir each year over the latter 10 years of plan implementation to improve resiliency and reduce susceptibility to insects, disease, and drought.	X	X		
Thin approximately 100 acres of red fir each year over the latter 10 years of plan implementation to improve resiliency and reduce susceptibility to insects, disease, and drought.			X	
Thin approximately 30 acres of red fir each year over the latter 10 years of plan implementation to improve resiliency and reduce susceptibility to insects, disease, and drought.				X
Aspen				
OBJ14. Restore or stimulate regeneration of at least 25 acres of aspen per year.	X	X		X
Restore or stimulate regeneration of at least 50 acres of aspen per year.			X	
Biological Resources Program				
Conservation of Habitat and Species Diversity				
OBJ15. Restore a minimum of two fens that are assessed to be at risk of conversion to meadow, based on fen inventory and ranking assessment (California Native Plant Society and LTBMU data) within the life of the Forest Plan.		X	X	

Comparison of Alternatives by Objective	Alt A	Alt B	Alt C	Alt D
OBJ16. Restore stream segments with degraded habitat in a minimum of 2 streams using natural channel design methods/techniques to design elements such as large wood and pools in aquatic habitats to maintain or improve biological processes (e.g., expansion of native species populations), biological characteristics (e.g., species composition), physical processes (e.g., erosion and aggradation), and physical characteristics (e.g., channel and over-bank flows) within the life of the Forest Plan. This will provide important aquatic habitat needed to support all life history processes.	X	X	X	X
OBJ17. Restore a minimum of 1 site to support self-sustaining aquatic populations within the life of the Forest Plan	CP	X	X	X
OBJ18. Within the life of the Forest Plan, Maintain or increase vegetation cover in meadows where 2009 LTBMU data shows that cover is insufficient.	CP	X	X	
Allow natural processes to control amount of vegetation cover in meadows.				X
OBJ19. Identify cave, cave surrogate, and/or cliff sites that are important to the survival, migration, reproduction, and dispersal of dependent species where removal of human impacts will improve species success. Remove human impacts at a minimum of one site identified, during the life of the Forest Plan.	X	X	X	X
OBJ20. Restore a minimum of three willow flycatcher nesting habitats in historic and currently occupied habitats.		X	X	
Invasive Habitats and Species (Aquatic and Terrestrial)				
OBJ21. Screen hand-carried/non-motorized watercraft are screened or show proof of boat inspection or decontamination at all staffed developed recreation sites (campgrounds, day use areas, resorts) check-in points (i.e. kiosks), within two years of the adoption of the Forest Plan.	X	X	X	X

Comparison of Alternatives by Objective	Alt A	Alt B	Alt C	Alt D
Protected Activity Centers (PACs) and Home Range Core Areas (HRCAs)				
OBJ22. Restore six California spotted owl PACs (representing approximately 30 percent of the known territories in the Lake Tahoe Basin) during the life of the Plan; treatments would be designed based on restoration needs of the specific PAC.		X	X	
OBJ23. Restore seven northern goshawk PACS (representing approximately 30 percent of the known territories in the Lake Tahoe Basin) during the life of the Plan; treatments would be designed based on restoration needs of the specific PAC.		X	X	
Species Refuge Areas				
OBJ24. Establish at least one self-sustaining Lahontan cutthroat trout sub-population in Fallen Leaf Lake, and implement appropriate conservation measures in Glen Alpine Creek in cooperation with the Lake Tahoe Basin Recovery Implementation Team by 2020.	X	X	X	X
OBJ25. Secure the existing Upper Truckee River (Meiss Meadows) Lahontan cutthroat trout sub-population (four miles of stream habitat) through maintenance removal of brook trout by 2015.	X	X	X	X
OBJ26. Reestablish Lahontan cutthroat trout in ten stream miles of the Upper Truckee River (from Meiss Meadows to the southern extent of Christmas Valley), in cooperation with California Department of Fish and Game by 2020.	X	X	X	X
OBJ27. Recover an additional seven subpopulations of LCT within fluvial and/or lacustrine ecosystems, as identified by the Tahoe Basin LCT Recovery Implementation team within the life of the Forest Plan.	X	X	X	X

Comparison of Alternatives by Objective	Alt A	Alt B	Alt C	Alt D
OBJ28. Collaborate with California Department of Fish and Game, US Fish and Wildlife Service, and Eldorado National Forest to identify and restore additional suitable habitat for yellow-legged frog as deemed appropriate. Complete restoration of seven high alpine lakes (composed of habitat areas that would support four sub-populations) adjacent to current yellow-legged frog populations in the Desolation wilderness by removing introduced trout species within the life of the Forest Plan.	X	X	X	X
OBJ29. Conduct physical habitat maintenance or enhancement that promotes long-term water availability and structural conditions to create areas for basking and/or cover, for the Hellhole yellow-legged for sub-population, within the life of the Forest Plan.	X	X	X	
OBJ30. Within the life of the Forest Plan, maintain or expand fishless high elevation aquatic habitats near existing or historic SNYLF sub-populations where such habitats are determined to support yellow-legged frog production and development and these actions will increase localized range of SNYLF.	X	X	X	X
Recreation Program				
OBJ31. Complete LTBMU National Visitor Use Monitoring every 5 years and review for trends and visitor satisfaction.	X	X	X	X
Interpretive Services Program				
OBJ32. Within 10 years, develop an interpretive signage program on the East Shore National Scenic Byway in cooperation with Nevada State Department of Transportation.	X	X	X	X

Comparison of Alternatives by Objective	Alt A	Alt B	Alt C	Alt D
Cultural Resources Program				
OBJ33. Nominate for listing to the National Register of Historic Places - the Comstock Historic Logging District, Angora Lookout, Cave Rock, Hawley Grade, Camp Richardson Resort, Meiss Cabin and Barn, and Skunk Harbor on the National Register of Historic Places during the Plan period.	X	X	X	X
OBJ34. Within five years of Plan approval, development of a management plan for arborglyphs throughout the Lake Tahoe Basin.	X	X	X	X
OBJ35. Add new interpretive elements (i.e. signs, boards, graphics, or new publicly-available printed materials) highlighting historic or cultural areas not yet interpreted in the Lake Tahoe Basin, during the Plan period.	X	X	X	X
Tribal Relations Program				
OBJ36. Revise the consultation protocol defined in the 1996 *Memorandum of Understanding between the LTBMU and the Washoe Tribe* within five years of Plan approval.	X	X	X	X
Access and Travel Management Program				
OBJ37. Implement BMP retrofits on 285 miles of NFS roads by 2025.	X	X	X	X
OBJ38. Implement BMP retrofits on 370 miles of NFS trails by 2025.	X	X	X	X

Comparison of Alternatives by Objective	Alt A	Alt B	Alt C	Alt D
Built Environment Program				
OBJ39. Implement BMP retrofits at all USFS facilities (including visitor centers, campgrounds, and parking lots.) by 2025.	X	X	X	X
OBJ40. Develop, plan and schedule to adoption for retrofitting five developed facilities rated as Development Scale 3-5 to include universally accessible features by 2025.	X	X	X	X
OBJ41. Prioritize buildings and facilities for construction, reconstruction or decommissioning based upon public benefit and ability to eliminate deferred maintenance.	X	X	X	X
OBJ42. Maintain 15 administrative sites to standard by 2025.	X	X	X	X
OBJ43. Maintain 44 recreation sites to standard by 2025.	X	X	X	X
Santini-Burton Acquired Lands/Urban Forest Parcels				
OBJ44. Conduct initial fuels reduction and forest health restoration treatments as needed on all urban forest parcels within five years of plan.	X	X	X	X
OBJ45. Conduct follow-up fuels treatments every 10-15 years in forested stands and every 5-7 years in brush-dominated stands.	X	X	X	X
OBJ46. Restore and vegetate areas of existing disturbance on up to 20 urban forest parcels annually	X	X	X	X
Notes: CP – Common practice in current program operations; may not have direction within current Plan and/or amendments but is implemented as part of the program				